

**West Virginia Real Estate Appraiser  
Licensing and Certification Board**

**MINUTES**

**June 22, 2016**

The West Virginia Real Estate Appraiser Licensing and Certification Board held a meeting on June 22, 2016 in the 4<sup>th</sup> floor Conference Room located at 405 Capitol Street, Charleston, WV 25311.

The following were in attendance: Glenn Summers, Chair; Dean Dawson, Vice Chair; Rachel Phillips, Secretary; The Honorable Anthony Julian; Michael Shaw; Doug Butcher; Mary Beth Aliveto; Nathan Nibert; Dale Dawson-Clowser; Sandy Kerns, Executive Director; Darlene Washington, AG Legal Counsel; Courtney Buskirk; Brenda Ashworth and Billie Hancock, board staff.

The meeting was called to order at 10:01 am.

***Reading of the Minutes***

Minutes from the April 20, 2016 and May 16, 2016 meetings were presented to the Board.

Mary Beth Aliveto motioned to approve the April 20, 2016 minutes. Judge Anthony Julian seconded. Motion carried.

Judge Anthony Julian motioned to approve the May 16, 2016 minutes. Rachel Phillips seconded the motion. Motion carried.

***Public Remarks***

Jason Mathias addressed the Board with questions about reinstating his apprenticeship. There are no written policies allowing lapsed apprenticeships.

***Executive Session***

Judge Anthony Julian made a motion to move into executive session. Dale Dawson-Clowser seconded the motion. Motion carried at 10:46 am.

Judge Anthony Julian motioned to close Executive session. Nathan Nibert seconded the motion. Motion carried at 12:06.

***Committee Reports***

**Standards Committee**

The Standards Committee met on May 3, 2016.

Complaint #14-016 Charles Boggs, III: The appraisals appear to lack consistency in their values and adjustments. No explanation or justification for adjustments were given. Listed bedrooms in wrong category. Committee has invited Mr. Boggs for an informal discussion with the Committee at the July 12, 2016 Standards meeting to discuss his appraisals.

Complaint #15-019: Complainant sent a letter stating that the appraiser failed the review, and pursuant to the federal statute, they are required to notify the Board. Investigation ongoing. Matter held over. Board requested additional information from the complainant for committee's review. No further information has been submitted at this time.

Complaints #16-001 and 16-002: Mr. Rhodes alleges that the appraisal completed by the respondents was not done correctly. He sent in an appraisal completed from another appraiser 18 months prior to compare the discrepancies. After reviewing the information submitted by the complainant, the committee concluded that no violations of the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice (USPAP), WV law or professional conduct took place. Additionally, the complaint was determined to be a value complaint. It is recommended the complaint be dismissed from the Board's docket.

Complaint #16-004: After reviewing the information submitted by both parties, the committee concluded that no violations of the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice (USPAP), WV law or professional conduct took place. Additionally, the complaint was determined to be a value complaint. It is recommended the complaint be dismissed from the Board's docket.

Judge Anthony Julian motioned to approve the Standards Committee report. Rachel Phillips seconded. Motion carried.

### Upgrade Committee

The Upgrade Committee met at 9am on April 20, 2016 to review one application for a supervisor permit.

Approve Upgrade 16-005, Application for Licensed Residential with comments and recommendations regarding work submitted. Applicant should explain/justify adjustments. Reconsider effective age.

Upgrade 16-004, Supervisor Application. To be held over. Committee would like to bring applicant in to discuss the work file submitted. Comparable seemed to be forced, did not bracket square footage, the difference between sale price and appraisal price seemed high, effective age was incorrect.

Upgrade 16-006, Certified Residential. To be held over. Committee would like to verify hours logged, commercial and residential, only allow 20 hours for one commercial work file submitted.

Upgrade 16-007, Licensed Residential. To be held over. Committee would like to request new logs, to choose 3 more work files. Log reflected cost approach done, work file did not utilize cost approach, comps not in neighborhood, and zoning appeared incorrect.

Dean Dawson made a motion to approve the Upgrades Committee report. Rachel Phillips seconded the motion. Motion carried.

### ***Executive Director's Report***

#### Licensing Reports

- Number of current licensed appraisers by classification  
Licensed Residential Appraisers - 123  
Certified Residential Appraisers - 235

## Certified General Appraisers - 247

- Registered Appraisal Management Companies (AMCs) Total- 97
- Temporary Report - 21 Temporary Permits Issued during the two months of Aprils and May

### Financial Report

- Purchasing Card Report
- FY16 Monthly Expenditures
- FY16 Quarterly Expenditures
- FY16 Yearly Expenditures
- FY16 Revenues

Judge Anthony Julian moved to accept the Executive Director's Report. Dale Dawson-Clowser seconded the motion. Motion carried.

### ***Legal Report***

Legal Counsel reviewed the Edward Miller Investment Petition Dismissal, Complaints 13-017 and a request regarding Supervising, presented a comment regarding consent decree 07-016 and presented the Consent Decree for Complaint 16-003a and 16-003b for signature.

### ***Old Business***

The matter of Board members attending the Association of Appraiser Regulatory Officials Conference was tabled.

The Executive Director updated the Board on the status of the online renewals capabilities through the new website design with WV Interactive.

The Board discussed the question regarding lapsed apprentice licenses. The board determined that based on board statute and rules, an apprentice with a lapsed license must complete a new apprenticeship application that follows 1) current Appraiser Qualification Board Criteria and 2) current WV Appraiser Board statutes and legislative rules.

The Request for Quotation (RFQ) for Study for Customary and Reasonable Appraisal Fees received no bids. Micheal Shaw motioned to re-bid the RFQ with a 30 day bid period. Rachel Phillips seconded the motion. Motion carried.

### ***New Business***

Ms. Kerns advised the Board of the upcoming changes to the Human Resource Management (HRM) and payroll system through WV OASIS system.

The announcement was made that Darlene Washington, legal counsel, would be retiring as of June 30, 2016. Judge Anthony Julian motioned to request a full time replacement from the Attorney General's Office. Rachel Phillips seconded the motion. Motion carried.

Sandy Kerns notified the Board of her intention to take medical leave. Judge Anthony Julian motioned to hire Darlene Washington as a contract employee, if needed, to help with Administrative duties while Ms. Kerns is on medical leave. Micheal Shaw seconded the motion. Motion carried.

Sandy Kerns and Dean Dawson have been assigned the task of gathering information to determine if the Board office will relocate.

Sandy distributed and reported on the upcoming changes to the ASC AMC Federal Registry Fees and Minimum Requirements.

Being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 1:53pm.



Glenn Summers, Chair